## Agenda

▲ロト ▲周ト ▲ヨト ▲ヨト ヨー のくぐ

#### Introduction to Bayesian analysis

#### Andrei Zhirnov

#### In a nutshell

- DGP
- Bayes's rule
- Workflow
- Working with R

- Bayesian analysis in a nutshell
- Data-Generating Process (DGP) and Bayes's rule
- A simple analysis of count data
- An example using the rstanarm package

> Andrei Zhirnov

In a nutshell

DGP

Bayes's rule

Workflow

Working with R

## Bayesian analysis in a nutshell

a way of statistical modelling that treats all unknowns as random variables

> Andrei Zhirnov

In a nutshell

DGP

Bayes's rule

Workflow

Working with R

## Bayesian analysis in a nutshell

▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□▶ □ のQ@

"unknowns" can include:

- parameters of the distributions
- regression coefficients
- missing values in the data
- future observations
- ...



Andrei Zhirnov

In a nutshell DGP Bayes's rul

Working

## Bayesian analysis in a nutshell

▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□▶ □ のQ@

treating all unknowns as random variables = assigning probabilities to all (subsets of) values they can take p

Â

> Andrei Zhirnov

In a nutshell

DGP

Bayes's rule

Workflow

Working with R Bayesian analysis in a nutshell



#### Andrei Zhirnov

#### In a nutshell

- DGP
- Bayes's rule
- Workflow
- Working with R

## Why Bayesian?

A D F A 目 F A E F A E F A Q Q

### Bayesian analysis will help you if

- you wish to interpret the intervals around point estimates in terms of probabilities of different values
  - credible intervals vs confidence intervals
- you wish to include information from other studies
  - or do meta-analysis
- you wish to plug the estimates into cost-benefit analyses
- you want to estimate a somewhat complicated model
- the number of observations is too small for conventional hypotheses testing

> Andrei Zhirnov

In a nutshell

DGP

Bayes's rule

Workflow

Working with R

## Data-generating process

- A chain of (hypothetical) events that produced each observation in the data
- ...can include both deterministic and random nodes
- ...can include unknown parameters

\*\* an abstraction! \*\*

▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□▶ □ のQ@



◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆臣▶ ◆臣▶ 臣 のへぐ

> Andrei Zhirnov

ln a nutshell

DGP

Bayes's rule

Workflow

Working with R

## $\blacksquare$ coefficients $\beta$ and the values of independent variables $\mathbf{x}_i$ determine $\theta_i$

$$\theta_i = \operatorname{logit}^{-1} \left( \beta_0 + \beta_1 x_{i,1} + \beta_2 x_{i,2} \right)$$

2 Nature returns  $y_i = 1$  with probability  $(\theta_i)$  and  $y_i = 0$ with probability  $(1 - \theta_i)$ 

- we observe  $\mathbf{x}_i, y_i$
- and wish to learn about  $\beta$

## Logit: DGP

> Andrei Zhirnov

In a nutshell

DGP

Bayes's rule

Workflow

Working with R

## Logit: Likelihood function

 $\textbf{0} \text{ coefficients } \boldsymbol{\beta} \text{ and the values of independent variables } \mathbf{x}_i \\ \text{determine } \theta_i \\ \end{cases}$ 

$$\theta_i = \operatorname{logit}^{-1} \left(\beta_0 + \beta_1 x_{i,1} + \beta_2 x_{i,2}\right)$$

 $\sim$ 

2 Nature returns  $y_i = 1$  with probability  $(\theta_i)$  and  $y_i = 0$  with probability  $(1 - \theta_i)$ 

Likelihood function: $L(\beta   \text{data}) = p(\text{data}, \beta)$			
$x_{i,1}$	$x_{i,2}$	$y_i$	$p(y_i oldsymbol{eta},\mathbf{x}_i)$
1	-1	1	$logit^{-1}(\beta_0 + \beta_1 - \beta_2)$
2	1	0	$1 - \operatorname{logit}^{-1}(\beta_0 + 2\beta_1 + \beta_2)$
0	3	1	$logit^{-1}(\beta_0 + 3\beta_2)$

$$L(\boldsymbol{\beta}|\text{data}) = \text{logit}^{-1}(\beta_0 + \beta_1 - \beta_2) \cdot (1 - \text{logit}^{-1}(\beta_0 + 2\beta_1 + \beta_2)) \cdot \text{logit}^{-1}(\beta_0 + 3\beta_2)$$

#### Andrei Zhirnov

In a nutshell

#### DGP

Bayes's rule

Workflow

Working with R

## A non-Bayesian approach

A D F A 目 F A E F A E F A Q Q

- **1** Assume that the true values of parameters  $\beta$  exist
- **2** Formulate likelihood function with the data at hand
- **3** Find  $\hat{\boldsymbol{\beta}}$  that maximizes this function
- (4) Treat  $\hat{\boldsymbol{\beta}}$  as the sample estimate of the true  $\boldsymbol{\beta}$

#### Andrei Zhirnov

In a nutshell

#### DGP

Bayes's rule

Workflow

Working with R

## Bayesian approach

### **1** Treat parameters $\beta$ as random variables

**1** Figure out which values they can take

- **2** Assign a distribution to its values (prior distribution)
- **2** Use data to update the beliefs about the distribution of  $\beta$  (this new distribution is called **posterior**)
  - **1** Formulate likelihood function with the data at hand
  - 2 Apply Bayes's rule:



> Andrei Zhirnov

In a nutshell

#### DGP

Bayes's rule

Workflow

Working with R

## Learning about weather by looking into window

### Parameter:

weather  $\theta \in \{\text{cold}, \text{warm}, \text{hot}\}$ 

DGP:

If it is cold, a person wears a coat with probability 0.7 and wears sandals with probability 0.3.

If it is warm, a person wears a coat with probability 0.5 and wears sandals with probability 0.5.

If it is hot outside, a person sandals with probability 0.2 and wears sandals with probability 0.8.

▲ロト ▲周ト ▲ヨト ▲ヨト ヨー のくぐ

Data:

4 in coats, 1 in sandals

#### Andrei Zhirnov

#### In a nutshell

#### DGP

Bayes's rule

Workflow

Working with R

## Likelihood calculations

## $\frac{\text{Parameter:}}{\text{weather } \theta \in \{\text{cold}, \text{hot}\}}$ $\underline{\text{DGP:}}$

 $p(\text{coat} \mid \text{cold}) = 0.7 \text{ and } p(\text{sandals} \mid \text{cold}) = 0.3$  $p(\text{coat} \mid \text{warm}) = 0.5 \text{ and } p(\text{sandals} \mid \text{warm}) = 0.5$  $p(\text{coat} \mid \text{hot}) = 0.2 \text{ and } p(\text{sandals} \mid \text{hot}) = 0.8$ 

### <u>Data:</u>

4 in coats, 1 in sandals

$$\begin{split} L(\text{cold} \mid \text{data}) &= c(5,4) \cdot p(\text{coat} \mid \text{cold})^4 \cdot p(\text{sandals} \mid \text{cold})^1 \\ &= c(5,4) \cdot 0.7^4 \cdot 0.3^1 \approx 0.360 \\ L(\text{warm} \mid \text{data}) &= c(5,4) \cdot p(\text{coat} \mid \text{warm})^4 \cdot p(\text{sandals} \mid \text{warm})^1 \\ &= c(5,4) \cdot 0.5^4 \cdot 0.5^1 \approx 0.156 \\ L(\text{hot} \mid \text{data}) &= c(5,4) \cdot (\text{coat} \mid \text{hot})^4 \cdot p(\text{sandals} \mid \text{hot})^1 \\ &= c(5,4) \cdot 0.2^4 \cdot 0.8^1 \approx 0.006 \\ (\text{coat} \mid \text{coat}) &= c(5,4) \cdot 0.2^4 \cdot 0.8^1 \approx 0.006 \\ (\text{coat} \mid \text{coat}) &= c(5,4) \cdot 0.2^4 \cdot 0.8^4 \approx 0.006 \\ (\text{coat} \mid \text{coat}) &= c(5,4) \cdot 0.2^4 \cdot 0.8^4 \approx 0.006 \\ (\text{coat} \mid \text{coat}) &= c(5,4) \cdot 0.2^4 \cdot 0.8^4 \approx 0.006 \\ (\text{coat} \mid \text{coat}) &= c(5,4) \cdot 0.2^4 \cdot 0.8^4 \approx 0.006 \\ (\text{coat} \mid \text{coat}) &= c(5,4) \cdot 0.2^4 \cdot 0.8^4 \approx 0.006 \\ (\text{coat} \mid \text{coat}) &= c(5,4) \cdot 0.2^4 \cdot 0.8^4 \approx 0.006 \\ (\text{coat} \mid \text{coat}) &= c(5,4) \cdot 0.2^4 \cdot 0.8^4 \approx 0.006 \\ (\text{coat} \mid \text{coat}) &= c(5,4) \cdot 0.2^4 \cdot 0.8^4 \approx 0.006 \\ (\text{coat} \mid \text{coat}) &= c(5,4) \cdot 0.2^4 \cdot 0.8^4 \approx 0.006 \\ (\text{coat} \mid \text{coat}) &= c(5,4) \cdot 0.2^4 \cdot 0.8^4 \approx 0.006 \\ (\text{coat} \mid \text{coat}) &= c(5,4) \cdot 0.2^4 \cdot 0.8^4 \approx 0.006 \\ (\text{coat} \mid \text{coat}) &= c(5,4) \cdot 0.2^4 \cdot 0.8^4 \approx 0.006 \\ (\text{coat} \mid \text{coat}) &= c(5,4) \cdot 0.2^4 \cdot 0.8^4 \approx 0.006 \\ (\text{coat} \mid \text{coat}) &= c(5,4) \cdot 0.2^4 \cdot 0.8^4 \times 0.006 \\ (\text{coat} \mid \text{coat}) &= c(5,4) \cdot 0.2^4 \cdot 0.8^4 \times 0.006 \\ (\text{coat} \mid \text{coat}) &= c(5,4) \cdot 0.2^4 \cdot 0.8^4 \times 0.006 \\ (\text{coat} \mid \text{coat}) &= c(5,4) \cdot 0.2^4 \cdot 0.8^4 \times 0.006 \\ (\text{coat} \mid \text{coat}) &= c(5,4) \cdot 0.2^4 \cdot 0.8^4 \times 0.006 \\ (\text{coat} \mid \text{coat}) &= c(5,4) \cdot 0.2^4 \cdot 0.8^4 \times 0.006 \\ (\text{coat} \mid \text{coat}) &= c(5,4) \cdot 0.2^4 \cdot 0.8^4 \times 0.006 \\ (\text{coat} \mid \text{coat}) &= c(5,4) \cdot 0.2^4 \cdot 0.8^4 \times 0.006 \\ (\text{coat} \mid \text{coat}) &= c(5,4) \cdot 0.2^4 \cdot 0.8^4 \times 0.006 \\ (\text{coat} \mid \text{coat}) &= c(5,4) \cdot 0.006 \\ (\text{coat} \mid \text{coat}) &= c(5,4) \cdot$$



$$p(\text{cold}) = \frac{A}{A+B+C}$$

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆臣▶ ◆臣▶ 臣 のへで

#### Introduction to Bayesian Prior × Likelihood analysis Andrei Zhirnov $A \cdot p(\text{sandals} \mid \text{cold})$ cold cold $\cap$ coat Bayes's rule $\cap$ $A \cdot p(\text{coat} \mid \text{cold})$ sandals warm $\cap$ coat warm $\cap$ sandals $B \cdot p(\text{coat} \mid \text{warm})$ $B \cdot p(\text{sandals} \mid \text{warm})$ hot $\cap$ coat hot $\cap$ sandals $C \cdot p(\text{coat} \mid \text{hot})$ $C \cdot p(\text{sandals} \mid \text{hot})$

Posterior

A D F A 目 F A E F A E F A Q Q

Andrei Zhirnov	(
In a nutshell	
DGP	
Bayes's rule	
Workflow	
Working with R	

Observed 1	person	$\mathrm{in}$	coat:	

 $\begin{array}{c} \mathbf{cold} \ \cap \ \mathbf{coat} \\ A \cdot p(\mathrm{coat} \ | \ \mathrm{cold}) \end{array}$ 

warm  $\cap$  coat  $B \cdot p(\text{coat} \mid \text{warm})$ 

 $p(\text{cold }|\text{coat}) = \frac{A \, p(\text{coat }| \text{ cold})}{A \, p(\text{coat }| \text{ cold}) + B \, p(\text{coat }| \text{ warm}) + C \, p(\text{coat }| \text{ hot})}$ 

> Andrei Zhirnov

In a nutshel

DGP

Bayes's rule

Workflow

Working with R  $p(\text{cold} \mid \text{data}) \propto p(\text{cold}) p(\text{data} \mid \text{cold})$  $p(\text{warm} \mid \text{data}) \propto p(\text{warm}) p(\text{data} \mid \text{warm})$  $p(\text{hot} \mid \text{data}) \propto p(\text{hot}) p(\text{data} \mid \text{hot})$ 

With the DGP and data as before:

 $p(\text{data} \mid \text{cold}) \approx 0.360$  $p(\text{data} \mid \text{warm}) \approx 0.156$  $p(\text{data} \mid \text{hot}) \approx 0.006$ 

and non-informative priors:

	cold	warm	hot
Prior	0.333	0.334	0.333
Likelihood	0.360	0.156	0.006
Posterior	0.689	0.299	0.011

> Andrei Zhirnov

In a nutshel

DGP

Bayes's rule

Workflow

Working with R  $p(\text{cold} \mid \text{data}) \propto p(\text{cold}) p(\text{data} \mid \text{cold})$  $p(\text{warm} \mid \text{data}) \propto p(\text{warm}) p(\text{data} \mid \text{warm})$  $p(\text{hot} \mid \text{data}) \propto p(\text{hot}) p(\text{data} \mid \text{hot})$ 

With the DGP and data as before:

 $p(\text{data} \mid \text{cold}) \approx 0.360$  $p(\text{data} \mid \text{warm}) \approx 0.156$  $p(\text{data} \mid \text{hot}) \approx 0.006$ 

and more informative priors:

	cold	warm	hot
Prior	0.01	0.09	0.9
Likelihood	0.360	0.156	0.006
Posterior	0.156	0.609	0.234

#### Andrei Zhirnov



Workflow

Working with R



Workflow

#### Andrei Zhirnov

#### nutshell DGP Rayos's m

Workflow

Working with R

## Number of bike thefts in Exeter

Data:

month	cases
Jan-19	14
$\operatorname{Feb}$ -19	24
Mar-19	20
Apr-19	15
May-19	19
Jun-19	19
Jul-19	14
Aug-19	15
Sep-19	42
Oct-19	25
Nov-19	18
Dec-19	9



◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆三▶ ◆三▶ 三回 のへぐ

## DGP

#### Andrei Zhirnov

In a nutshell

DGP

Bayes's rule

Workflow

Working with R Each month's value of  $k_i$  is randomly drawn from the Poisson distribution with the location parameter at  $\lambda$ 

Andrei Zhirnov

In a nutshel

DGP

Bayes's rule

Workflow

Working with R

### Poisson distribution:

 $p(k) \propto \lambda^k e^{-\lambda}$ 





◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆目▶ ◆目▶ 目 のへぐ

#### Andrei Zhirnov

ln a nutshell DGP

Workflow

Working with R

## Likelihood function

▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□▶ □ のQ@

DGP: Each month's value of  $k_i$  is randomly drawn from the Poisson distribution with the location parameter at  $\lambda$ 

$$p(k_i|\lambda) \propto \lambda^{k_i} e^{-\lambda}$$

$$p(\text{data}|\lambda) \propto \prod_{i=1}^{N} \lambda^{k_i} e^{-\lambda} = \lambda^{\sum_{i=1}^{N} k_i} e^{-N\lambda}$$
$$\propto \lambda^{234} e^{-12\lambda}$$

### Priors

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆三▶ ◆三▶ ○三 のへぐ

#### Introduction to Bayesian analysis

#### Andrei Zhirnov

In a nutshell

#### DGP

Bayes's rule

#### Workflow

Working with R

### An opportunity to

- incorporate qualitative information or prior knowledge into estimation
- restrict the range for the parameter search
- reduce the computational resources needed for estimation

#### Andrei Zhirnov

Workflow

### Uniform on $(0, \infty)$ : $p(\lambda) \propto 1$ if $\lambda > 0$

- non-informative
- improper (does not integrate to 1)

• 
$$p(\lambda \le 0) = 0$$



Prior 1

#### Andrei Zhirnov

In a nutshell

DGP

Bayes's ru

Workflow

Working with R

## Prior: $p(\lambda) \propto 1$ Likelihood: $p(\text{data}|\lambda) \propto \lambda^{234} e^{-12\lambda}$ Posterior: $p(\lambda|\text{data}) \propto \lambda^{234} e^{-12\lambda} \cdot 1 = \lambda^{234} e^{-12\lambda}$

The posterior distribution of  $\lambda$  is a gamma distribution with shape=235 and rate=12



Posterior 1

#### Andrei Zhirnov

In a nutshel

DGF

Bayes's rule

Workflow

Working with R Gamma distribution with shape=2 and rate=0.1:  $p(\lambda) \propto \lambda e^{-0.1\lambda}$ 

- weakly informative
- Gamma prior is conjugate to Poisson likelihood makes it easy to compute the posterior

Prior 2

• 
$$p(\lambda < 0) = 0$$



> Andrei Zhirnov

In a nutshell

DGP

Bayes's ru

Workflow

Working with R

# $\begin{array}{l} \mbox{Posterior 2}\\ \mbox{Prior: } p(\lambda) \propto e^{-0.1\lambda}\\ \mbox{Likelihood: } p({\rm data}|\lambda) \propto \lambda^{234} e^{-12\lambda} \end{array}$

 $\text{Posterior: } p(\lambda | \text{data}) \propto \lambda^{234} e^{-12\lambda} \cdot \lambda e^{-0.1\lambda} = \lambda^{235} e^{-12.1\lambda}$ 

The posterior distribution of  $\lambda$  is a gamma distribution with shape=236 and rate=12.1



#### Andrei Zhirnov

Wor

## Another way of recording the posterior distribution

		lambda
hell	1	16.95578167
5	2	19.22808885
	3	19.13343529
es's ruie	4	18.89169685
kflow	5	18.70425733
king	6	18.96495068
I K	7	17.50372344
	8	21.25867386
	9	19.25259324
	10	19.36690632
	11	19.46680601
	12	20.60875773
	13	20.89049706
	14	18.37696661
	15	19.26760371
	16	17.7946507
	17	18.86570533

Number of columns = number of parameters

Number of rows = number of random draws from posterior distribution

▲ロト ▲周ト ▲ヨト ▲ヨト ヨー のくぐ

#### Andrei Zhirnov

In a nutshell DGP Bayes's ru Workflow

WORKHOW

Working with R

## What to do with the posterior distribution?



> Andrei Zhirnov

In a nutshell

 $\mathrm{DGP}$ 

Bayes's rule

Workflow

Working with R

## What to do with the posterior distribution?

### Summarize it:

- Point estimates
  - Posterior mean
  - Posterior mode
- Credible intervals
  - Central intervals (a 90% credible interval spans between 5th and 95th percentile)

• Highest posterior density intervals

\* in the bike theft example: Mean  $(=\frac{\text{shape}}{\text{rate}})$ : 19.58 Mode  $(=\frac{\text{shape+1}}{\text{rate}})$ : 19.67

90% credible interval: between 17.46 and 21.64

> Andrei Zhirnov

In a nutshel

DGP

Bayes's rule

Workflow

Working with R

## What to do with the posterior distribution?

Compute posterior distributions for the quantity of interests

- Conditional probabilities in logit/probit models
- Marginal effects
- ...

> Andrei Zhirnov

In a nutshell

DGP

Bayes's rule

Workflow

Working with R

## What to do with the posterior distribution?

Compute predictive distributions for the "data" that does not exist: Simulations method:

• sample parameters from the posterior distribution

- apply DGP to produce a new observation
- repeat and summarize

Analytical method

$$p(\tilde{y}|y) = \int_{\Theta} p(\tilde{y}|\theta) \, p(\theta|y) d\theta$$

▲ロト ▲周ト ▲ヨト ▲ヨト ヨー のくぐ

## Prediction

▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□ ● ● ●

#### Introduction to Bayesian analysis

#### Andrei Zhirnov

In a nutshell

DGP

Bayes's rule

Workflow

Working with R



Mean: 19.5 Mode: 19 90% predictive interval is from 12 to 27

> Andrei Zhirnov

In a nutshel

 $\mathrm{DGP}$ 

Bayes's rule

Workflow

Working with R

## Another way of computing the posterior distribution

MCMC (Markov chain Monte Carlo) / Metropolis algorithm:

- 1 Pick a point in the parameter space
- Sample a proposed move (to another point) from the proposal distribution
- 3 Use the ratio of posterior densities to accept/reject the proposed move
- Repeat 2 and 3 until the distribution of the visited points in the parameter space does not depend on the path

The distribution of the visited points in the parameter space converges to the target posterior distribution

> Andrei Zhirnov

In a nutshel

DGP

Bayes's rule

Workflow

Working with R Stand-alone programmes for running MCMC:

- BUGS
- WinBUGS
- JAGS
- OpenBUGS
- Stan

(typically fed with data and model from R or Python)

R Packages for specifying Bayesian models command-style:

▲ロト ▲周ト ▲ヨト ▲ヨト ヨー のくぐ

- brms
- rstanarm
- MCMCpack

#### Andrei Zhirnov

- In a nutshell
- DGP
- Bayes's rule
- Workflow
- Working with R

## rstanarm package

A D F A 目 F A E F A E F A Q Q

- relies on the **Stan** implementation of HMC for estimation
- includes commonly used "frequentist" models
  - the syntax of stan\_lm() mimics the syntax of lm()
  - the syntax of stan\_glm() mimics the syntax of glm()
  - the syntax of stan\_glmer() mimics the syntax of glmer()
- uses weakly informative priors as defaults
- produces MCMC draws and summaries